

Decision Maker: Environment PDS Committee

Date: 2nd February 2016

Decision Type: Non-Urgent Non-Executive Non-Key

Title: BROMLEY PARKING – CAPITAL PROGRAMME REVIEW

Contact Officer: Chris Cole – Programme Manager, Transport & Highways
Tel: 020 8313 4630 E-mail: chris.cole@bromley.gov.uk

Chief Officer: Nigel Davies, Executive Director of Environment & Community Services

Ward: Bromley Town Centre

1. Reason for report

This is a post implementation review of two capital schemes associated with Bromley Town Centre parking: –

- The Hill Car Park – remedial strengthening (propping) works
- Bromley Town Centre – increased parking capacity

2. **RECOMMENDATION(S)**

The Environment PDS Committee to consider and comment on the content of this report.

Corporate Policy

1. Policy Status: Existing Policy
 2. BBB Priority: Quality Environment
-

Financial

1. Cost of proposal: N/A
 2. Ongoing costs: N/A
 3. Budget head/performance centre: Capital Programme
 4. Total current budget for this head: £232k and £420k
 5. Source of funding: LBB Capital
-

Staff

1. Number of staff (current and additional): 2
 2. If from existing staff resources, number of staff hours: 1 Fte
-

Legal

1. Legal Requirement: Statutory Requirement
 2. Call-in: Not Applicable
-

Customer Impact

1. Estimated number of users/beneficiaries (current and projected): Borough wide
-

Ward Councillor Views

1. Have Ward Councillors been asked for comments? Not Applicable
2. Summary of Ward Councillors comments: N/a

3. COMMENTARY

Background

- 3.1 This report provides Members with a post completion review of two related capital schemes concerning parking in Bromley Town Centre.
- 3.2 The first relates to issues with the structure of The Hill multi-storey car park. On 29 September 2010, the Executive agreed to undertake temporary propping of the car park to maintain capacity and approved a sum of £280k to be included in the Capital Programme. This capital estimate was later reduced by £48k in July 2014.
- 3.3 Subsequently, the impact of the closure of the Westmoreland Road car park for re-development caused additional concern. The second capital scheme therefore dealt with increasing the parking capacity within Bromley Town Centre. In May 2012, the Executive agreed that a sum of £520k from capital receipts could be used for the following schemes: -
- Permanent Strengthening and making safe of The Hill MSCP to increase capacity
 - On-street parking in the Elmfield Road and Elmfield park area
 - Removal of the public toilets in Mitre Close and replacement with a surface car park
 - Converting the St Blaise staff car park to a public car park at weekends.
- 3.4 The capital estimate was reduced to £420k in February 2013 when the tender price for the Hill came in significantly under the estimate (see 3.14). £60k of the funding from capital receipts has subsequently been replaced with £60k of TfL funding..
- 3.5 Following the conclusion of these works, this report details the outcomes of the schemes.

Scheme 1 - The Hill (Remedial Propping)

Information

- 3.6 A review was undertaken of parking options to ensure sufficient Bromley Town Centre capacity – Remedial options for use of The Hill MSCP were identified as part of the review. £232k was set aside to meet the cost of these works.
- 3.7 The repair work undertaken followed approval of Option 2 in the report (ES10127) at the 29 September 2010 meeting of Executive. The scope of work included repair to parapets and propping floors to alleviate problems with a potentially weak top slab at a cost of £204k plus consultants fees.

Achievement of expected benefits

- 3.8 Parapet strengthening and propping achieved the expected benefits to extend use of structure (< 5 years) without unsightly fencing and offered time to affirm the future of car park and the potential to strengthen later/undertake additional work at a later date. The final cost of the works, including consultant's fees was £222k.

Unexpected benefits

- 3.9 None.

Unexpected problems

- 3.10 The cost variation was as a result of some previously unknown cables, the erection of additional warning signs, plus some additional jointing to repair drainage and concrete.

User stakeholder experience

- 3.11 The technical work to determine the scope of strengthening and propping and subsequent implementation of those works was undertaken using the Council's Highway Engineering Consultant and term highways contractor. The work was undertaken satisfactorily.

Lessons learned.

- 3.12 None.

Scheme 2A – The Hill (Permanent Strengthening):

Information

- 3.13 Routine inspections of The Hill MSCP had identified a weak top slab and understrength parapets. A study to investigate possible strengthening options was commissioned and in autumn 2011 parapet strengthening work was completed together with installation of temporary propping to support the section of weak top slab. However, the temporary propping had (necessarily) been installed within parking bays and this reduced the available car parking capacity at The Hill.
- 3.14 Westmoreland Road MSCP was due to be handed over to developers in September 2012. Members had indicated concern that this may adversely impact on overall Bromley Town Centre car parking capacity during the busy Christmas period. Accordingly recommendations for a phased approach to parking capacity improvements were submitted to 23rd May 2012 meeting of Executive (ref report ES12077) and this included a scheme to demolish the section of weak top slab at The Hill MSCP. This work would enable removal of temporary propping, freeing up car parking spaces and helping to alleviate any potential capacity shortfall during the Christmas period.
- 3.15 The Council's term Highways and Engineering Consultant was commissioned to generate the design and manage the tender process, followed by project management and site supervision once the project had reached site. The estimated value of the demolition work was below OJEU thresholds and hence four contractors were invited to tender, having been identified from the Council's approved list.
- 3.16 J.F. Hunt (Demolition) Ltd submitted the most economically advantageous tender (£257,791). A waiver document provided the approved authority to proceed with contract award to John F. Hunt. The key deliverables of the contract were to return 123 car parking spaces prior to Xmas 2012.
- 3.17 Further project costs included Consultants fees to cover the costs of design, project management and site supervision.

Achievement of Expected Benefits

- 3.18 The project was delivered successfully with the work being completed according to programme and with substantial completion on 30th November 2012.

3.19 The final value of the demolition works was £241,057, which is within the value of the tender.

Unexpected Benefits

3.20 None

Unexpected Problems

3.21 During the demolition process cracks became evident near the top of columns located directly below the demolished slab. This hadn't been foreseen and the intention was to leave these columns full height in the event there was a future requirement to reinstate the demolished slab. Discussions were held with the contractor however the definitive reason for crack formation was never identified. The matter was resolved by the Contractor reducing the columns down to 'stub' height (approximately 1.0m) and applying a highly visible protective coating to the stub. This was at no additional expense to the Council and reduced column height should not compromise any future work reinstating the slab, should this be required.

3.22 Some temporary direction arrows and lining in the car park, which had to be altered to address temporary traffic management during the course of the demolition, work had not been reinstated.

User Stakeholder Experience

3.23 The user stakeholder experience was positive. The project was undertaken in an occupied car park but issues regarding noise, dust etc. were dealt with appropriately by the Council's contractor resulting in minimal negative impact on Bromley's car park users and nearby residents and businesses.

Lessons Learned

3.24 Given the nature of this work and its purpose (to secure additional car parking capacity during the busy Christmas period) it would have been preferable to programme the project earlier in the year to allow sufficient contingency in the event of unforeseen problems.

Scheme 2B - Elmfield Road On-street Parking

Information

3.25 Given the location of Westmoreland Road car park, Councillors raised concerns that the southern part of the Town Centre would suffer from a paucity of parking spaces. Officers undertook an audit of the area to find potential on-street parking spaces. The roads just to the north of Bromley South Station (Elmfield Road and Elmfield Park) provided the opportunity to provide significant additional on-street parking.

Achievement of Expected Benefits

3.26 19 additional parking bays have been achieved. This was slightly down on the initial estimate of 20-30, but some bays were removed following the safety audits due to sightline issues, and compromises with the number of taxi bays removed.

3.27 The final cost of the scheme was £17,590 which was within the initial estimate.

Unexpected Benefits

3.28 None

Unexpected Problems

3.29 The project experienced significant delay as a result of objections from TfL's Public Carriage Office (PCO) regarding the reduction in the number of taxi bays. The PCO's co-operation is required in order to licence taxi ranks. Despite an LBB survey showing that the taxi bays were rarely used, and when they were, they were frequently abused by taxi drivers parking as opposed to plying for trade, the PCO refused to reduce the numbers or compromise. This led to protracted negotiations with the PCO, taxi drivers' representatives and the Borough before a compromise was finally reached. This held up the scheme for a number of months. This was exacerbated when the official response from the PCO during the official consultation returned to their original position and not the agreed one. Fortunately the correspondence had been kept, but this held the project up further.

Lessons Learned

3.30 In dealing with the PCO in future schemes, expect the response to be negative if it is perceived to impact negatively on taxis, even if evidence shows this not to be the case. Engage TfL Ambassador/senior staff sooner.

Scheme 2C – Mitre Close

Information

3.31 This scheme saw the removal of the previously closed toilet block in Mitre Close next to The Hill car park, and saw the area replaced with a surface car park. The toilet block had been demolished previously.

3.32 Given that the new car park was adjacent to the Bromley North Village public realm project, the surfacing and landscaping of the area was enhanced to ensure that the two projects matched in aesthetic terms.

Achievement of Expected Benefits

3.33 It was originally estimated that 25-35 spaces could be accommodated on the site. The implemented car park has 27 spaces plus a loading bay for the businesses in Naval Walk. It was opened in time for Christmas 2013, although it was partially used as a storage yard for the Bromley North Village works before re-opening in time for the Christmas 2014. It is now permanently available as a car park.

3.34 The cost of the scheme was £128k, which was higher than the initial estimate. This was mainly because the quality of the materials used was higher than originally specified in order to tie the scheme into the Bromley north Village public realm scheme.

3.35 Based on current use, annual income from this car park is expected to be in the region of £85k per annum.

Unexpected Benefits

3.36 None

Unexpected Problems

3.37 None

Lessons Learned

3.38 None

Scheme 2D – St Blaise

Information

3.39 The St Blaise scheme saw the staff car park converted to a public car park at weekends. This was a relatively small scheme (£23k), as all that was required was the implementation of a pay and display machine, plus some minor accommodation works, such as re-lining the car park and resolving some minor drainage issues.

Achievement of Expected Benefits

3.40 The car park has been open since November 2013 to the public and holds 72 vehicles, although this includes some staff pool vehicles which are left over the weekend.

Unexpected Benefits

3.41 The car park is available for wedding guest vehicles.

Unexpected Problems

3.42 The usage of the car park has been very low. It appears that this is because its location is not particularly convenient and that there are still spaces in the more convenient car parks throughout the year.

Lessons Learned

3.43 It appears that despite erecting signs and promoting this facility on the Council's website, drivers still prefer to queue for facilities slightly closer to the town centre. A pilot to pre-book parking spaces online in the St. Blaise car park has also had little take-up.

Summary

3.44 The measures described above have delivered an additional 241 car parking spaces in Bromley town centre, during the period Westmoreland Road car park has been closed. Once the new development opens at Westmoreland Road a further 300 spaces will be added therefore no further investment in car park capacity is recommended at this stage.

3.45 A review of Bromley town centre car park capacity & usage will be undertaken early in 2017 to determine whether any additional capacity is required.

4. POLICY IMPLICATIONS

4.1 Building a Better Bromley 2014/17 – Outcome 5 Improving Transport, Aim 5.1 – Monitoring the impact on parking provision of the closure of Westmoreland Road car park and taking action to address any problems.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 This report provides information on the post completion review of two capital schemes - The Hill Car Park – remedial strengthening scheme and the Bromley Town Centre – increased parking capacity scheme.

5.2 The tables below summarise the financial position of both schemes: -

Financial Summary

Scheme 1 - The Hill Car Park - strengthening works scheme

	£'000	£'000
Original capital estimate (capital receipts)	280	
Less reduction agreed by Executive in July 2014	<u>-48</u>	
Latest approved capital estimate		232
Final scheme costs		222
Net underspend		<u><u>-10</u></u>

Scheme 2 - Bromley Town Centre - increased parking capacity

	Original Estimate £'000	Latest Approved £'000	Final Cost £'000	Variance £'000
The Hill - permanent strengthening to increase capacity	450	245	241	-4
On street parking - Elmfield Road & Elmfield Park area	10	25	25	0
Mitre close surface car park	50	130	128	-2
Conversion of St Blaise car park to public car park at weekends	10	20	23	3
Total	<u>520</u>	<u>420</u>	<u>417</u>	<u>-3</u>
Funding				
Capital receipts	520	360		
TfL LiP funding	0	60		
Total funding	<u>520</u>	<u>420</u>		

5.3 Overall the two schemes came in £13k below the latest approved capital estimate and this balance will be returned to capital receipts.

Non-Applicable Sections:	Personnel & Legal implications
Background Documents: (Access via Contact Officer)	ES12077 - Bromley Town Centre – Increasing Parking Capacity ES10127 – The Hill remedial strengthening works